The Hon Steven Joyce  
Chair, Vocational Education and Training Review  
25 January 2019

Dear Mr Joyce,

On behalf of the NSW Adult Literacy and Numeracy Council, I am pleased to have the opportunity to make a submission to the Vocational Education and Training Review. Our Council is the peak professional organisation for adult literacy and numeracy professionals, including teachers, education managers, community outreach teachers, teacher educators and researchers in NSW.

Our submission focuses on priorities in the area of adult literacy and numeracy/foundation skills. If you and your committee have questions or seek clarification about any aspect of our submission, please don’t hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Keiko Yasukawa, President, NSW Adult Literacy and Numeracy Council
1. The Review will have regard to VET funding, policy and regulatory settings and how they can be optimised to support both school leavers and workers to maximise the achievement of relevant skills and employment outcomes from the VET sector.

Australia needs a lifelong education policy. The opportunities and right to access education and training throughout one’s lifetime should be both promoted and made visible in policy in a society where rapid technological change and globalisation are requiring people to continually learn new knowledge and skills in order to contribute productively to the economy and in civic life. Adult literacy and numeracy is foundational to all forms and areas of learning, and therefore the field is in need of a supporting policy.

2. It will examine skills shortages in VET-related occupations, in particular any tension between VET outcomes and the needs of industries and employers, and what might be done to better align these.

3. It will consider expected changes in future work patterns and the impact of new technologies and how the VET sector can prepare Australians for those changes and the opportunities they will bring.

See point 8 regarding the need for a renewed workplace adult language, literacy and numeracy program.

4. The Review may consider the flexibility of qualification structures, particularly for mid-career workers, and for industries seeking rapid deployment of new skills.

As discussed under point 6, the need for flexibility of qualification structures in adult literacy and numeracy/ foundation skills is critical. Adult literacy and numeracy is not an industry and there is no ‘one-size-fits-all’ curriculum or training package that is appropriate for all of the diverse learners and their diverse needs. Over standardising the curriculum means that individual learners’ needs will not be adequately met.

5. The Review may have regard to community perceptions of the effectiveness of the VET sector and the accessibility and utility of information about VET options and outcomes, both for employers and students, including information linking training options to employment outcomes.

It is crucial that governments – both Federal and states – do everything possible to restore public confidence in Australia’s VET system. There are large numbers of young adults in Australia who, for a range of reasons did not finish secondary schooling or had an unsuccessful educational experience. There are also older adults who have a personal and/or economic need to develop their English language, literacy and numeracy
in order to address changing demands and opportunities in their lives. These adults all deserve a quality post-secondary education system that they can trust and access.

6. It may review whether additional support is needed for vulnerable cohorts, including those currently unemployed and at risk of unemployment, or those with low literacy and numeracy skills.

There is no question that additional support is needed for vulnerable cohorts, including those currently unemployed and at risk of unemployment, or those with low literacy and numeracy skills.

Historically, very little information has been collated concerning the clients (and potential clients) of language, literacy and numeracy provision in Australia. However, statistics collected on the callers to the Reading Writing Hotline provide some important background information in considering the needs of such adults. The Reading Writing Hotline is a national, Commonwealth funded phone service for adults who are seeking information related to adult literacy. The Hotline’s statistics therefore represent a national sample of adults who feel that their literacy and numeracy skills are not adequate for their everyday functioning in the personal, social and/or work domains and who are therefore seeking appropriate LLN services. The Hotline has collected demographic information on its callers since its inception in 1974, and has demonstrated patterns that have remained very consistent in many important aspects, such as gender (predominantly male), age (predominantly 25-40 yrs) and language background (predominantly English speaking background).

The following statistic in particular is relevant to the argument the NSWALNC has made concerning the gap in provision.

---

Employment Status of callers (2016-17 reporting period)

The graph shows that only 18% of callers are jobseekers who can be referred to a SEE program. While there is insufficient funded provision available other than the SEE program for jobseekers, 33% of callers are not seeking work and a further 41% are already employed. There is a paucity of programs to which the Hotline can refer such callers.

Adults with low literacy and numeracy proficiencies

A further important statistic is related to the ratio between callers from an English as the first language (L1), and English as an additional language background. In the period reported, 81% of callers were from an English as L1 background, showing that there is a significant number of adults whose literacy and numeracy needs are not explained by their first language.

Another statistical source of information about the state of adult literacy and numeracy is the results of Australia’s performance in the OECD Survey of Adult Skills (SAS). Most of the media and industry reports have focussed on how Australia was placed in the international league tables (5th in literacy and 15th in numeracy among the 34 participating countries)\(^2\). However, what has attracted less focus and which is arguably of equal if not greater significance, is what the SAS results can tell us about the social outcomes of the not insignificant proportion of those surveyed who demonstrated low literacy and numeracy proficiencies\(^3\).

---


\(^3\) Some 12.6% of adults in Australia attain only Level 1 or below in literacy proficiency... and 20.1% attain Level 1 or below in numeracy.... At Level 1 in literacy, adults can read brief texts on familiar topics and locate a
Analysis undertaken by international researchers on the self-reported data of SAS participants who were assessed as having low proficiencies found that:

Although, they are more likely than the rest of the population to exhibit certain characteristics, such as lower levels of educational attainment, lower rates of employment or more disadvantaged backgrounds, adults with low literacy are found among all socio-demographic groups and in all walks of life. .... For most outcomes, levels of engagement in literacy practices appear to be as strong predictors as proficiency, indicating the importance of encouraging more intense use of these skills both in and outside of work. .... Adults with low proficiency are considerably less likely than their more proficient peers to participate in formal or non-formal adult education or training programmes, which is mostly due to the socio-demographic and employment characteristics of this population. However the lower participation rates among the low proficient adults does not appear to be a consequence of their lack of motivation as much as of the presence of various obstacles to participation, such as lack of time and the cost of training.  

In this study, Australia was found to be among the three top countries where the variation in the degree of participation in adult education and training (both formal and informal) between those with higher literacy proficiencies and those with lower proficiency was the greatest – suggesting that those most in need are not accessing and participating in education and training. In addition to participation in education and training, literacy and numeracy proficiencies have been found to be correlated to other important social outcomes:

The link between higher literacy and such social outcomes as trust in others, participation in volunteer and associative activities, belief that an individual can have an impact on the political process, and better health is stronger in Australia than in most other countries 5.

Thus access to adult education and training, and in particular literacy and numeracy development not only affords benefits to those individuals whose literacy and numeracy proficiencies improve, but have critical implications for social cohesion and democracy in Australia.

The appendix contains two case studies that provide a human face for these statistics. The first is a story selected and abridged from a collection of specific information identical in form to information in the question or directive. In numeracy, adults at Level 1 can perform basic mathematical processes in common, concrete contexts, for example, one-step or simple processes involving counting, sorting, basic arithmetic operations and understanding simple percentages'. From OECD, 2013, Australia: Country Note – Survey of Adult Skills First Results accessed 8 December 2018 at https://www.oecd.org/skills/piaac/Country%20note%20-%20Australia_final.pdf.

4 Grotlüschen, A. et al. (2016), Adults with Low Proficiency in Literacy or Numeracy, OECD Education Working Papers, No. 131. Accessed 8 December, 2018 at http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/5jm0v44bnmx-en

of such student stories published by the Victorian Adult Literacy and Basic Education Council (VALBEC)⁶. The second is a story written by an adult literacy learner on the theme of ‘educational journeys’.⁷

Other priority areas

In addition to ensuring that the needs of those with the lowest literacy and numeracy proficiencies are met, there are other types of needs that require urgent attention. These include the needs of adults in ‘low skilled’ jobs who may have completed secondary or higher education but whose skills levels have declined as a result of lack of use. This group of workers is identified as being at high risk of unemployment when their jobs become redundant due to technological changes or overseas outsourcing. Another area of need is critical literacy and numeracy among workers in precarious employment or underemployment, or in workplaces where there are no worker representatives to educate workers about their rights and how to exercise them. It is clearly not enough to help people find employment if workers are not supported in continuing to develop skills in response to changing needs and forms of work. There are ways to involve workers in the identification and planning of workplace training and education. A new approach to workplace literacy and numeracy provision is needed.

Greater understanding and suitable program options are needed for young early school leavers who have dis-engaged from mainstream schooling for diverse reasons. Partnerships between VET providers with schools and social service providers can ensure that young adults’ welfare as well as further education and training are supported through appropriate educational and social services, without the common social stigma attached to young people who do not complete their schooling.

7. The Review may seek out case studies of best practice in VET, and consider whether specific trials should be undertaken to test innovative approaches likely to deliver better outcomes.

There are many cases of ‘best practice’ in adult literacy and numeracy delivery in NSW and in other Australian states. We list below references to some of the research of literacy and numeracy programs undertaken in the last decade that have analysed the salient features that make these case studies of ‘best practice’. The programs that are discussed include: accredited programs in TAFE; community based adult literacy programs in Aboriginal communities; non-accredited community based programs for refugee women; young urban Aboriginal learners re-engaging with the school curriculum in a community centre; ESL learners in a labour market

---

⁶ Bowen, T. 2011, A Fuller Sense of Self, Victorian Adult Literacy and Basic Education Council, Springvale South.

⁷ NSW Adult Literacy and Numeracy Council 2004, NSW adult literacy students write - Blue Sky Bicycle and other journeys, NSW Adult Literacy and Numeracy Council, Sydney.
program; and integrated literacy and numeracy provision in vocational courses. Although the programs are varied in contexts, what they all illustrate about successful engagement and outcomes in adult literacy and numeracy programs include:

- The ability of the teachers to build connections with the learners and among the learners;

- Programs that can be tailored in outcomes, content and pedagogical approach so that the learners themselves can see and make connections with the particular demands for literacy and numeracy development in their life contexts;

- Programs where learners have ready access to a range of services (counselling, health, accessibility, career advice, childcare) and resources (library, canteens);

- Teachers who have both pedagogical and disciplinary knowledge and expertise to teach literacy and numeracy to adults;

- Teaching and learning contexts that encourage and support teachers to exercise agency and risk-taking in order to address their learners’ diverse needs and contexts.

**NSW case studies**


**Other Australian case studies**


NSWALNC submission to Review of VET


8. The Review should have regard to the scope and outcomes from any previous or forthcoming reviews, consultation to date, and inputs made by industry and peak groups.

Of direct relevance to this Review are the recommendations from the recent OECD report: *Building skills for all in Australia: policy insights from the survey of adult skills*8. The report made eight key recommendations to strengthen Australian adults’ ‘basic skills’:

1. Increase participation of women in STEM fields by breaking down gender stereotypes and encouraging women to enter these fields.

2. Strengthen the focus on mathematics throughout secondary education.

3. Identify students in post-secondary VET who are at risk of low basic skills and provide targeted initiatives to support them.

4. Ensure that literacy and numeracy skills are part of the quality criteria in post-secondary VET.

5. Encourage post-secondary VET providers to address weak literacy and numeracy skills.

6. Reach out to disconnected youth and prevent dropout at earlier stages of education.

7. Use pre-apprenticeships to help NEETs re-enter education and training, and to find employment.

8. Improve access to childcare facilities for young mothers. (pp. 10-11)

While recommendations 1 and 2 go to issues beyond what VET alone can address, they highlight the criticality of how VET is positioned. VET options, including ‘second chance’ education for early school leavers, is not well known nor understood by many schools. There is a need for government initiatives to more effectively shift public perception of VET so that VET is seen as an integral part of Australia’s commitment to lifelong education. This would be imperative in being able to address recommendations 3, 6 and 7.

---

Recommendations 4, 5 and 6 are significant in ensuring quality pathways and support for people needing to further develop their literacy and numeracy to succeed in VET qualifications and to participate more effectively and fully in civic life. There is a need for deliberations involving a range of stakeholders (VET learners, classroom teachers, managers, professional peak body representatives, and researchers) to review and deliberate on what should be ‘quality criteria’ in VET. Quality is important in different ways for different stakeholders, but currently they do not sufficiently attend to what matters for learners and the capacity to support them in achieving a broad range of outcomes that VET ought to be able to help them achieve. As mentioned earlier, quality teachers are necessary for quality educational experiences and outcomes. Although teacher education programs for school teachers have undergone a major reform\textsuperscript{9}, and university teaching standards have been tightened\textsuperscript{10}, quality of teaching in VET continues to be undermined by the minimalist requirements in pedagogical knowledge and expertise (Cert IV in TAE). Investment in the learning of teachers is a necessary investment in order to achieve quality teaching and learning. Graduate entry adult literacy and numeracy teaching qualifications are not viable as full-fee paying programs as long as teachers in the field continue to be engaged as casual teachers. The teaching workforce in the field is currently heavily reliant on teachers who were qualified when the cost of their adult literacy and numeracy teaching qualification was subsidised through CSPs, the state provider (eg TAFE) or through the more recent (but now discontinued) scholarship initiative for adult LLN practitioners. Without renewal of the workforce with recently qualified teachers, the field will fail to be informed by new knowledge and empirical studies that are needed for continuous improvement.

Recommendation 8 as well as the need for provision of other services (health, financial and library) should be considered as minimum requirements for all VET providers.

The adult literacy and numeracy field has been dismayed by the elimination of a source of targeted Commonwealth funding for workplace literacy and numeracy improvements. The Australian Industry Group has been advocating for a restoration of the Workplace English Language and Literacy (WELL) programme funding, echoing concerns of their own members about the impact of workers’ low literacy and numeracy levels on productivity. As workplaces demand new skills and work practices, the need for targeting workplace literacy and numeracy funding will continue

\textsuperscript{9} E.g. the establishment of AITSL, and new guidelines for the accreditation of teacher education programs in Australia, encompassing different levels of teacher standards from Graduates Teachers to Lead Teachers, supervised practicums and a final year Teaching Performance Assessment. https://www.aitsl.edu.au/teach/standards

to exist. The report from the former Centre for Literacy in Canada *Embedding literacy and essential skills in workplace learning: breaking the solitudes*\(^{11}\) provides a useful framework to review the previous WELL program and to commence discussions about a new model. Of particular importance is the ‘situated-expansive model’ of workplace programs that affords workplace innovation by engaging both the employers and the workers in the design of programs.

An area that has been long neglected is a strong state and Commonwealth policy framework for adult education provision in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities. The current Australia Research Council funded project *Adult literacy and Aboriginal community well-being in western NSW*\(^{12}\) is providing evidence of the connections between improved literacy and numeracy and improved social outcomes, particularly health. The program researched in this project and other program initiatives in Australian Indigenous communities are documented in the report *Enhancing training advantage for remote Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander learners*. This report concludes with the identification of very unambiguous need for policy action:

> Beyond the Skills for Education and Employment program, the absence of an adult literacy and numeracy policy or facilitating structures in most jurisdictions adds another layer of difficulty to achieving community-based outcomes for adult learning. At the present time programs designed to build English language literacy and numeracy (outside VET or employment targets) for remote Aboriginal people simply do not fit in an existing policy or program area. (Guenther et al 2017, p. 33)

The report *Aboriginal adult English language literacy and numeracy in the Northern Territory: a statistical overview*\(^{13}\) provides further evidence of the need for action, and clear and specific policy recommendations.

---


Appendix: Adult learners' stories

Joe's Story

I was born in the [redacted] and I grew up in the area around [redacted]. I hated school. Looking back, sometimes it feels like I never went to school. It's almost like there was no school experience for me. It's all so very blurry. It was just hard for me to take a lot in. I didn't care either. I didn't think it was worth knowing. What I did learn, I think I probably blocked out. Even today I surprise myself with things that come out of my head. I wonder, where did that come from or how did I know that.

I got put into a home for girls as an uncontrollable child because I wouldn't stay at school. They had a school set up at the home but as long as you could add up, do long division, and write your name, in their view you had completed your schooling. I certainly wasn't educated. I wasn't given books. None of that was encouraged.

When I finally left there, I went downhill in terms of my mental health. Finally, a friend broke through the barrier I had created and got me help and I was encouraged to go to Southern [redacted]). Initially, I didn't want to do it. I thought I would be a failure. I was sure I would be ridiculed because of my age. I didn't have any idea that I knew quite as much as I do know.

When I first started, as the tutors remind me, I would sit with my head bowed down. I wouldn't look at anyone. I was too scared to answer questions, for fear of being wrong. I was so frightened. I remember the first day very clearly. They needed to work out where I was, in terms of my reading and writing, so they got me to write the word CAT. I remember I shook so much you would look at that writing and think that a small child had written it. When I started I shook, and I shook, and I shook. I sat there the whole time with my head down.

I have been coming to [redacted] for a few years now. I even went out and bought a computer. I am still learning how to use it. It has opened up such a new world for me. I think improvement has happened for me through a lot of encouragement from the staff. I had been told all my life that I was stupid. I was scared of failure. I had made the choice to withdraw and I convinced myself that I didn't know any better.

I suppose I have always wanted encouragement. It's interesting, just when I think I might be unable to learn anymore, I do learn more. You are never too old. The learning is endless. I absorb so much. Sometimes I wish I could go to school every day. It seems so easy to learn. It's fun too.

When you find some success in learning, you can be more open and involved in the community. Say for example with the election and voting. I
had never voted before, never, up until five years ago, which is precisely
the time that I started coming here. Learning gave me the confidence to
want to vote, and to be interested in doing it. Suddenly I took note of what
was going on and why it was going on.

There was one activity that we did in class where we were encouraged to
write a list of some of the issues that we thought our local Council should
look into. So I started writing about people in wheelchairs because my

From there, I started looking at different issues around town that should be dealt with.
Before I came here I wouldn’t have even thought about those issues. My
mind has been opened. Previously, I could not even read the newspaper.
Now I can’t wait to get it. I read it as I’m having my breakfast. I can be a
bit of an ogre if I’m interrupted while reading the newspaper.

I want to do further education. I would love to do my HSC. It probably
sounds silly at my age but I would like to try. There is still a little part of
me that is scared of looking into it because I am fearful that I won’t be
able to do it. But it’s something I’ve always wanted to do. It always seems
to be there in the back of my head. Maybe it’s time I moved it to the front
of my head, and put the steps in motion.

I would just love to see more people take that step and come to places
like . You just don’t know what doors can be opened for you. I know
with me, when I took that first step I never dreamed I would still be here,
that I would still be learning. I am a different person now. I am happy. I
love to learn. I look forward to coming. I suppose over time I felt I could
trust the people here. I felt safe. I had never had that. It means I have
come out of myself. I can’t explain it. The teachers are fantastic and that
makes learning so much easier. There is a great atmosphere in the class.
Now I will go home and get straight on the computer, and think to myself, I
know how to do this. Sometimes I wish I could go to school every day. It
seems so easy to learn. It’s fun too.

A personal journey towards education

Every time I see one of those ads on the TV of someone who has won
some money on a scratchy, I think of the time when I had won and lost
$50,000 because I could not read.

It was a Tuesday like any other Tuesday. I was just walking around with
nowhere to go, just looking at the world go by. As I was walking I was
thinking it would be a good idea to buy a scratchy. I am a superstitious
person so I started to think where I should buy it, and when. But I was
looking for a job, so I put my mind on that for a minute, then, I thought it
was too good a day to worry about it. As I was walking along, I saw a
newsagent, so I decided to go and buy a scratchy and a paper. I went in
and stood at the counter and looked at all the scratchies. The man behind the counter came over to me.

‘Can I help you?’

‘Yes’, I said. He looked at me.

He said ‘Do you want a Lotto?’

‘No’, I said, ‘I’d like a scratchy’.

He grabbed at the one dollar ones.

‘No’, I said, ‘I’d like a five dollar one.’

With an expressionless look on his face, ‘Which one? There are four types so would you like one of each type?’ he said with a painted smile on his face. Feeling a little silly, I said:

‘Can I have one of the pyramid ones?’ I had seen it on the TV. He ripped one off and handed it to me. I gave him the five dollars and went outside to scratch it. This is when I got into trouble. At this time of my life I had not started at TAFE, so I couldn’t read what to do. I looked at the scratchy and felt like a fool. I walked out of the shop. I started to walk down the road and then I said to myself ‘go back to the shop and ask the newsagent to show you how to do it’.

Feeling good, I went back to the shop. When I got there the newsagent was arguing with an old lady. I stood there and waited. It seemed to be going on forever. Someone else came into the newsagent. And in between arguing with the old lady, he served the man. I was still standing there waiting. All the time I was thinking ‘why can’t I read how to scratch it?’

So I went to the bench to look at it. I looked at it. I looked at the wall. I looked at my feet. The newsagent was arguing with the old lady again. It was too much for me. I lost it! All the years of not being able to read got to me at that one time. I went back to the counter. The newsagent was serving everyone but me. I was invisible to him at the counter. I went back to the bench. I looked at the scratchy in my hand. I looked at the people at the bus stop, hoping one of them would come in and help me. I felt like I was in a hole with no way out. It got too much for me. I just had to scratch it and be rid of it.

What happened next I will never forget. I just started scratching and before I knew what had happened, I had scratched all the squares off. On my scratchy, there were three $50 000 squares! Yes! I had won $50 000! Goodbye work. Hello holidays. There was a man standing beside me, and
in my euphoria, I said to him, ‘I’ve got a winner!’, then I swaggered back to the counter to show my winning ticket. I handed it to the newsagent. As I waited for him to say ‘congratulations’, my whole world seemed to stop as he said, ‘You had $50 000, now you haven’t. You’ve scratched too many squares.’ With a smirking smile across his face, he now explained to me how I should have played the game. I had blown it by scratching too many squares, even though it was a winning ticket.

I felt like I wanted to go into a crack in the footpath and hide. The newsagent just went on serving people. I folder the ticket in half and left the shop. Then I remembered the ad I had seen on TV for adult literacy. So here I am. No richer for the scratchy. But since I have been coming to TAFE, I have found myself with other riches – of friendship and knowledge.